

Peer Review Summary Document

(12/7/2017)

Peer Review Plan

<https://www.usgs.gov/atom/73902> [46 KB PDF].

Title and Authorship of Information Product Disseminated

Guidelines for Determining Flood Flow Frequency – Bulletin 17C, by John F. England, Jr., Timothy A. Cohn, Beth A. Faber, Jerry R. Stedinger, Wilbert O. Thomas Jr., Andrea G. Veilleux, Julie E. Kiang, and Robert R. Mason, Jr.

Public Comments and Responses

A provisional draft of the product was posted on the Advisory Committee for Water Information, Subcommittee on Hydrology Bulletin 17C (B17C) webpage (URL: https://acwi.gov/hydrology/Frequency/b17c/bulletin17c_draft_for_public_review.pdf) and a solicitation for public comment was published through the Federal Register (URL: https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2016/02/22/2016-03570/announcement-of-public-review-period-for-a-report-of-the-advisory-committee-on-water-information?utm_campaign=subscription+mailing+list&utm_medium=email&utm_source=federalregister.gov). Fifty comments were received from a variety of Federal, State, and local agencies and interest groups. The public comments and the authors responses are posted at: <https://acwi.gov/hydrology/Frequency/b17c/comments/>.

Peer Reviewers Expertise and Credentials

Reviewer 1 has a Ph.D. in water resource systems and over 30 years experience as a university professor and researcher in civil and environmental engineering with a primary focus on hydrologic and statistical methods for analyzing water resources systems. The reviewer has contributed to 10 ten books and 135 peer-reviewed publication.

Reviewer 2 has a Ph.D. in civil engineering and over 10 years as professor and researcher in water-resources engineering and hydrology. The reviewer has taught numerous graduate-level courses in statistical hydrology and probabilistic methods, and written 106 peer-reviewed publications.

Reviewer 3 has B.S. in civil engineering and is a licensed professional engineer with 29 years experience in water resources engineering and hydrology. The reviewer also extensive experience in practical applications of statistical hydrology serving as a consulting engineer and has authored 10 publications.

Reviewer 4 has a Ph.D. in civil engineering and is a licensed professional engineer with over 20 years experience in civil and environmental engineering as a consultant and university professor. The reviewer has authored 30 peer-reviewed publications and contributed to 2 books on hydrologic modeling.

Charge Submitted to Peer Reviewers

Peer reviewers were asked to make an objective evaluation of the report and to complete a report evaluation checklist developed by the SOH. The reviewers were asked to comment on each report section and to evaluate, for example, whether the new methods were an improvement over the old, whether the SOH should recommend their adoption by all Federal agencies, whether the panelist had major concerns regarding their practicality. The reviewers were also provided the public comments that were received and asked to consider whether the authors had adequately addressed these comments.

Summary of Peer Reviewers Comments and Summary of USGS Response to Comments

In general, the reviews of the draft report were favorable and encouraging. The reviewers welcomed the inclusion of the new methodologies, particularly the expected moments algorithm, the multiple Grubbs-Beck test, and use of Bayesian GIS skew estimators. Some concern was expressed about the clarity of the document, particularly those sections that describe the setting of the EMA perception thresholds. All of the reviewers indicated satisfaction with the author's responses to the public comments.

All reviewers written comments and completed checklist forms, as well as the authors responses to the comments are available at:

<https://acwi.gov/hydrology/Frequency/b17c/comments/authors-responses-b17c-usgs-review-summary-09Apr2017.pdf>.

The Dissemination

A USGS-approved, prepublication version of the report is posted at:

https://acwi.gov/hydrology/Frequency/b17c/bao-approval-copy_IP-065340_Cohn-Bulletin17c-09-25-2017.pdf. The published information product will be released in the USGS Techniques and Methods Report and will be available at <https://pubs.usgs.gov/>.